

---

ICANN71 | Virtual Policy Forum – NextGen Presentations Day 2  
Tuesday, June 15, 2021 – 10:30 to 12:00 CEST

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Welcome to today’s part two presentations of the NextGen at ICANN71. I’d like to give a special thank you to my mentors for this round—Cherie Stubbs, Aris Ignacio, and Dessalegn Yehuala—who have done an incredible job prepping our students leading up to this week, leading up to prep week (the middle week), and now of course ICANN71 week. They’ve done an incredible job getting them ready.

UNIDENTIFIED FEMALE: Recording in progress.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Sorry, I forgot to say start the recording. They’ve done such an incredible job getting everybody ready and prepping the students, and I can’t thank you enough for the job that you have done with our students and continue to do. So thank you very much.

So now on to logistics. I will be the remote participation manager for this session. Please note that this session is being recorded and follows the ICANN expected standards of behavior. During this session, questions and comments will only be read aloud if submitted within the Q&A pod. I will read them aloud during the time set by the chair or moderator of the session.

---

**Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.**

---

Interpretation for this session will include many languages. Click on the interpretation icon in Zoom and select the language you will listen to during the session.

If you wish to speak, please raise your hand in the Zoom room and once the session facilitator calls upon your name, our technical support team will allow you to unmute your microphone. Before speaking ensure you have selected the language you will speak from the interpretation menu. Please state your name for the record and the language you will speak if speaking a language other than English. When speaking be sure to mute all other devices and notifications. Please speak clearly and at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation.

All participants in the session may make comments in the chat. Please use the dropdown menu in the chat pod and select respond to all panelists and attendees. This will allow everyone to view your comment. Please note that private chats are only possible among panelists in the Zoom webinar format. Any messages sent by a panelist or a standard attendee to another standard attendee will also be seen by the session hosts, co-hosts, and other panelists.

With that, I do not think that our first presenter is in the room, Aysel Maharramli. If I'm not mistaken, I do not think she is here. We did not do a sound check with her. I'm going to double check to see if she's in the room, and I do not see her. So, Siranush, we're going to go to our second presenter who is Pavlo Burdiak, and then once Aysel arrives we can move forward with Aysel. So, Pavlo, you have the floor.

---

PAVLO BURDIAK: Thank you very much, Deborah.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Please just say next slide when you are ready, and please remember to speak slowly. And you have 10 minutes. I will let you know if you go over. Thank you so much.

PAVLO BURDIAK: Thanks again, Deborah, as well. Good morning, good afternoon, and good evening, dear ladies and gentlemen. My name is Pavlo Burdiak. I am a Ph.D. student at the Doctoral School of Law and Political Sciences of the University of Szeged located in Hungary. It is an honor for me to address this meeting as a NextGen participant.

The topic that I would like to introduce to you today is part of my current Ph.D. research. It presents the European dimension of international law regulating the interaction of states and social media platforms in preserving the freedom of expression on social media. Next slide, please.

Firstly, I will introduce the social media regulatory approach in Europe. And then I will discuss the relevant international freedom of expression frameworks and elaborate on how they apply to states and social media platforms. Next slide, please.

When we talk about social media governance the regulatory approach applied in Europe is coregulation. Coregulation is a legal approach in which norms creation and implementation are shared among both

---

public and private actors, in our case among states and social media platforms. Now let's review the international human rights legal frameworks and their applicability to states and social media platforms. Next slide, please.

The United Nations provides a general legal foundation for human rights online protection, while the Council of Europe targets specifically the European region. Concerning the freedom of expression, some of the most significant legally binding instruments are the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights within the United Nations, the European Convention on Human Rights within the Council of Europe, as well as the relevant declarations, resolutions, recommendations, reports, and case law which interpret the applicability of the Covenant and the Convention in the Internet domain.

If we analyze the respective legal instruments of the United Nations and the Council of Europe, we will find two postulates that underpin the preservation of freedom of expression on the Internet. Firstly, both organizations affirm that freedom of expression must be equally protected online just as offline.

Secondly, there are negative and positive obligations to preserving freedom of expression. Negative obligations require actors not to violate human rights. In this regard, freedom of expression policies must comply with the principals of legality, legitimacy, and necessity and proportionality. I will refer to these principles as international norms.

---

Concerning positive obligations they necessitate active measures such as the adoption of policies, programs, and laws aiming to ensure that freedom of expression is protected. Now let's move on to the applicability of these frameworks to states and social media platforms. Next slide, please. Thank you.

In the case of states it is pretty straightforward. Since the international legal instruments within the United Nations and Council of Europe were devised and adopted by states, they are directly applicable to states parties to the respective international agreements.

As regards the application of international legal instruments to social media platforms, a formal legal duty for platforms to follow international human rights law is debated because international law instruments were drafted by states and, therefore, designed to bind states and not private entities such as social media platforms. However, some human rights commitments are being accepted by certain platforms through the United Nations Guiding Principles on Business and Human Rights also known as the Ruggie Principles.

At the same time I would like to make a case for the practical reasonableness of applying international freedom of expression framework to social media platforms by establishing a link between states' positive obligation to protect freedom of expression online on the one side and social media content moderation policies on the other side. Next slide, please. Thank you.

When it comes to states' positive obligations regarding the freedom of expression on social media platforms states generally introduce

national laws that encourage platforms to proactively remove illegal online content. By delegating the responsibility to social media platforms states have a positive obligation to ensure that human rights on the platforms are protected according to international standards applicable to a particular state.

However, social media platforms unlike states do not have a formal legally binding obligation to follow international norms. Therefore, two scenarios are possible. A particular social media platform can either follow or violate international human rights law. If social media platforms' content moderation policies comply with international norms, then the states' conventional approach of developing a legal duty for platforms to remove illegal content meets the state's positive human rights obligations.

However, suppose a social media platform's content moderation policies violate international norms. In that case the states' conventional approach of developing a legal duty for platforms to remove illegal online content fails to satisfy the states' positive human rights obligations.

The rationale behind such reasoning is the following. If a particular social media platform does not follow international norms, then the state by encouraging the platform to proactively tackle illegal content also encourages the platform's content moderation policies that fall short of international human rights standards. In this instance the state also has to ensure that freedom of expression is protected on the social media platform. Next slide, please.

---

To sum up, this is a key takeaway from my presentation. Firstly, international human rights law provides for negative and positive obligations concerning the protection of freedom of expression online. Negative obligations mean that the right to freedom of expression must not be violated. Positive obligations mean that not only must freedom of expression not be violated but it must also be protected.

Secondly, international freedom of expression frameworks directly apply to states parties to international agreements. Yet formal legal duty for social media platforms to follow international norms is difficult to fathom. Although some platforms do undertake certain human rights commitments via the Ruggie Principles.

Finally, I argue that determining the degree of compliance of social media platforms with international norms is a necessary precondition to establishing whether or not the states' conventional approach of creating a legal duty for platforms to remove certain types of harmful content is sufficient to satisfy the states' positive human rights obligations. Hence, I believe the role of states and social media platforms in social media governance should be reevaluated according to this line of reasoning. Next slide, please.

You can see some references. And the next slide. Some more references. And the final slide, please. I thank you all very much for your attention.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Thank you, Pavlo. Very well presented.

---

PAVLO BURDIAK: Thank you.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: The interpreters love people like you. Very clear.

PAVLO BURDIAK: I did my best.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: You did a very great job. Very well done. Okay, are there any questions for Pavlo? I see that Daniil has his hand raised. Daniil, go ahead.

DANIIL GOLUBEV: Yes. Okay, Pavlo, thank you very much for wonderful presentation. It was extremely knowledgeable and this topic is very important for me as well. I would like to ask you about the relationship between the state and private companies.

For example, the case of Donald Trump, when he was banned from Twitter. Do you consider it an internal policy of the company that simply doesn't want people who violate their own internal agreement to be part of the social network, or do you consider it a state censorship because social media platforms have become very politically influential recently? Thank you.



---

PAVLO BURDIAK:

Thank you very much, Daniil, for this really up-to-date question. This is a complicated issue, and there is no simple answer that I would be able to present at hand because it is very debatable among the international scholars. At the same time, it depends on the type of jurisdiction that we are talking about.

For example, in Europe private entities including social media platforms are much more regulated at the government level than they are in the United States. So the jurisdiction matters. That is a first takeaway. And if we talk about this particular instance that you mentioned when Donald Trump was banned from Facebook, and important thing to be mentioned is that Facebook has a very unique policy and approach of dealing with complicated issues of content moderation.

For example in 2018, Facebook announced that it would create a special oversight board. An oversight board which is an independent body. It consists mostly of international law scholars and is supposed to give some opinions on controversial cases of content moderation that take place in Facebook as well as recommendations and reviews of Facebook policies.

This body was established and it did review the case of the Donald Trump ban. What the oversight board said, it was just I believe about a month ago, was that it was reasonable for Facebook to introduce the ban for Trump. However, there are some questions regarding to the proportionality of such a restrictive measure. So Donald Trump was banned permanently from using Facebook and Instagram, and the

---

oversight board said that it is not that clear that such a harsh restrictive measure should have been applied in this case. And they requested Facebook authorities, you can say, or Facebook as a company to explain why this measure was applied. The Facebook has six months to respond, and we will need to follow up on this particular development.

So again, the Facebook case is very interesting because they have a special oversight board. And the oversight board does consider the international law principals, especially the ones which are mentioned in the United Nations Guiding Principles for Business and Human Rights which I briefly discussed in my presentation. So I hope this answers your question.

DANIIL GOLUBEV: Yes, thank you very much.

PAVLO BURDIAK: Thank you.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Thank you, Pavlo. Are there any other questions for Pavlo? Okay, thank you. If you find that you have any other questions for Pavlo, please feel free to send them to [engagement@icann.org](mailto:engagement@icann.org) or you can reach out to me and we can share his email address.

Okay, we're going to move on to our next presenter, Stelios Kavvadias. Stelios?

---

STELIOS KAVADIAS: Hello, everybody. Hey, greetings from Greece. My name is Stelios Kavadias. I'm a master's student at the University of Stockholm in the field of open government. Today I'm going to talk to you about open public data. Next slide, please.

First of all, what is it? We're talking about any data and information produced or commissioned by public bodies that can be freely used, reused, and distributed by anyone. Open public data can be big in the sense that they have a big volume, but it can always be also the case that it doesn't have a big volume. Next slide, please.

Some types of open public data are energy, environment, population, transport, health, and education. For instance, the energy consumed in a particular area in a day, the temperature of the sea, the mean age of the population, the number of cars that cross a bridge in a day, the vaccination rate of a region, or the scores of international exam of students. Next slide, please.

So what are the benefits? First of all, for the public sector itself it increases the efficiency and the quality. For instance, the biggest water management company in Greece has opened up its data to the public and through a datathon, a data related competition, it invited people to suggesting solutions that would help and to predict water leakages but also to find very quickly cases of water stealing. That is an acute problem in Greece.

---

Secondly, it has also beneficial effect on the economy because it sparks innovation and creates new business models. For example, companies that combine open public data with private data in order to create a new service or data integration companies.

Then we also have benefit for the society as when you open up data you have more transparency and thus you can have more accountability toward what is happening in the public sphere. And also, you can increase participation by inviting citizens to be part of the decisions or part of the discussion if you open up this discussion and data to everybody to inspect. Next slide, please.

Of course, there are some challenges. First of all, the quality of data. If you have a dataset that may concern a developing situation but is three years old and the data are not correct or are incomplete, it doesn't have much value for anyone.

Second of all, in terms of accessibility it is not enough to release a dataset and expect everybody to understand what it is about. You need to provide metadata, which is data about data, that explains what exactly you include in this particular dataset. Then you should also open up APIs which are small interfaces that can be accessed by software services. And through these APIs the software services may receive real-time data on demand.

And finally for the wider public you should provide visual discovery tools which allow website with a mouse or with a finger to play around with the data that you have made available and let them discover what is valuable for them.

Then we also have the challenge of privacy. Before you release the data and open them up, you need to make sure that they are anonymized or pseudo-anonymized and/or other techniques that contribute to privacy. But you also need to make sure that the source of your data is secure in the sense that nobody can alter the data in the source. Next slide, please.

Let's talk about a use case. I believe you may have heard the phrase one man's trash is another man's treasure, and geoFluxus takes it to another level. It makes sure that the waste is more easily transferred from the producer to the one that is interested in it. So in EU, private companies are obliged by law to provide the volume and type of their waste.

So far this data had been used only for compliance reasons, but geoFluxus accessed this open public data and created an interactive map that shows the different flows of waste within Europe within a particular area in Amsterdam, a wider region. And also, it plans to expand.

So basically what they are doing is showing to the people where the waste, maybe from a big construction site, ends up. And they can also include privately held data such as invoices from private companies and predict the production of waste from companies and then also do the matchmaking between the companies that produce the waste and the companies that may be interested in the waste but on a local level.

In this way you avoid, for example, the transportation of all this waste to another country or to another [region], let's say to Poland, and then

this waste [to be again imported] to the Netherlands in order to be used in other productions. So in this way they have achieved to keep the waste actually to help the environment, help the local economy, and also avoid some unnecessary transportation of waste. So it's a very good example. I would urge you to go and maybe check more about their work. Next slide, please.

So let's talk about now policy recommendation. With my team, the Greenorama team, we participated in the beginning of 2021 in a thinkathon competition which was a policy recommendation competition where 258 teams from EU and Canada participated. We submitted our idea in the category of environment, and it was awarded as the best one in the environment category but also received the award of the audience prize.

So what was it? It concerned the creation of a single source of open data related to marine and maritime life that provides easy access and meaningful insight to citizens, businesses, policymakers, and other stakeholders by adapting to their needs and interests.

When we were researching this topic we found out that many organizations, including EU itself, are publishing data related to the sea or to water. But there are no common rules for the publishers of such data. So we first of all suggested the creation of simple rules that would help other people that are interested in investigating those data and creating value. Because the data preparation is a very painful and time-consuming process, so we want to make it easier for everybody.

---

And then to create visual discovery tools apart from being in a position to download raw data so citizens and other stakeholders can take answers to questions such as, is it safe for me to swim or fish here? Has the situation improved in terms of pollution after the state imposed a fine to a particular factory that was by the sea? And so in this way to scrutinize also the public authorities and push forward to the protection of the environment. Next slide, please.

So ICANN has not left behind, I mean is not behind in terms of open public data, and has launched the open data initiative. More particularly, it has launched the open data platform back in March 2020, so over a year ago, which follows the philosophy that all data that can be published should be published. And this platform offers free and unfettered access to both the organization and the community.

There you can find open data, both raw and through visual discovery that we mentioned earlier, for example, regarding registrars. And everybody with the use of the mouse can play around and discover more about the organization itself. I would urge you to go to the website of ICANN and play around with the platform. It's very useful and you might discover something that you don't know today for ICANN and for its work. Next slide, please.

So finally, I would like to thank you for your attention. And I would like also to ask you if you have any questions or you may be interested in datathons or other kinds of competitions related to data regardless if you are an individual, if you represent an SME or a [inaudible]

---

innovation hub or something similar, of course feel free to contact me. And I'm open to questions regarding my topic. Thank you very much.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Thank you, Stelios. Fascinating. Very well done. Do we have questions for Stelios? And, Stelios, you can put your email address in the chat so that people can email you. Any hands? Okay, so if you ever have any questions...let's see. Is there something in the chat? Okay, and then follow-up questions, you can email [engagement@icann.org](mailto:engagement@icann.org) or email Stelios directly. He can put his email in the chat.

And we are going to move on with Liza Kukovska as our next presenter. Liza?

LIZA KUKOVSKA: Hello. Do you see me?

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Yes.

LIZA KUKOVSKA: Yeah? Hello, fellow ICANNers. I am Liza Kukovska, a master's student from National University of Kyiv-Mohyla Academy in Ukraine. Today I will quickly present to you my study on Digital Divide in Ukraine: Demography, Dynamics, Solutions. Next slide, please. Thanks.

I hope it can give you an understanding of the Ukrainian experience and make you at the same time think about your country's situation. This



---

study is an analysis of the Ukrainian Internet and the existence of inequality in it.

Is there a digital gap in Ukraine? Does the demographic factor affect the number of regular users? Are there any changes in the last 10 years? What's done to overcome inequality?

Those questions [and research] are also important for Internet advertising, development of electronic government tools, support of the information society, and development of competition within the country. Next slide, please. Thanks.

We'll begin with the data taken from statistical research done by the Internet Association of Ukraine with [inaudible] group. I want to point out here the method this kind of information is gathered before we go on to discuss it. I don't think everybody knows it.

It is done in two steps. First is the analytical company makes face-to-face interviews with different people all around the country. Then they are making a representative panel of Internet users to further explore them. Secondly, they ask to install to home and work computers a special software. The methodology allows monitoring all Internet resources visited by Ukrainian users, both national and foreign. The panel represents Internet users throughout Ukraine aged 15 and older. Next slide, please.

The regular user in this study is a person who visits the Internet at least once a month. On the slide you can see quarterly measurements of regular users which shows a significant increase in Internet use by

---

Ukrainians over the past 10 years. Only 28% in 2010 when in the third quarter of 2019 it was already 71%. This is taking into account that until the third quarter of 2014 the graph still showed data from the Autonomous Republic of Crimea and the occupied territories of Ukraine. So let's [find out] the hidden digital gap divide behind these numbers. Next slide, please.

The reason for this study for me was the many articles I read about the inequality still existing in Ukraine, by gender, for example. Many respectable websites like UNDP wrote about the technological divide within men and women here which seemed to me very unrealistic. So I found data from the Internet association which clearly shows that at least in tech there is equality. After this, I began to check more articles and dig deeper into the whole inequality situation from every aspect. Next slide, please.

And the next one, aspect is age. In the graph on the slide we can see a sharp decline in the percentage of people over the age of 65 who understand technology against the total number of them living in the country. But it is not so bad because in the aspect of age in digital divide we can confidently talk of change, of positive dynamics.

A memorandum was recently signed by the ministry of digitalization with the Internet association of Ukraine on the development of libraries. This is done with the expectation of using these libraries as basis for training centers for the older generation. Places where everyone can digitalize themselves.

---

Many similar projects are supported by our ministry of [digitalization]. And also a fun fact: candidates from one of the last election campaigns even came up with a new kind of commercial for themselves by offering free computer courses for older generation so they would for them.

But there is another problem. This spring my class in Kyiv-Mohyla Academy did research on people over 65 and their relationship with tech and the Internet. The results of [two-step] questionnaire showed that 55% of adolescents believe that their grandparents—grandfathers, grandmothers—have to improve their digital skills while only 35% of the senior representatives believe that it is important for them. This unwillingness to engage in Internet technology within the older demographic is actually confirmed by similar research done by UNDP together with the Laboratory of Innovative Development. So sometimes articles are true, but not all of the time. Next slide, please.

The next aspect is inequality by area. The most obvious problem in digital inequality is the gap between urban and rural areas. In Ukraine there is a tendency for poverty to increase with a lesser size of a city. And this correlates with the emergence of digital inequality between mega cities and small cities, including rural areas.

It can be seen that 38% of the rural population in Ukraine do not have access to high-speed Internet at all. Also according to the ministry of economic development and trade in 2018, 53% of Ukrainian schools and 90 of medical institutions are also not connected to the network. That was in 2018.

And after that the efforts of the state manifested here and there. So on December 2020, for example, the law on electronic communication was adopted which provides for a number of steps for the development of remote regions. Where if there are objective reasons it is expensive to pull the Internet wires, the state will send additional funds to support operators and providers who will be engaged in the [internetization] of these remote regions. A program of [internetization] of schools and libraries region is also being developed. Next slide, please.

Talking about Internet penetration or access as you can say between different countries in the world according to the Internet international communications union ITU, Ukraine's position at the global level is in the middle of the list of countries for 2017. It was 79 position among 176 countries.

But an interesting fact is that we were one position higher than China in 2017 when in 2018 China entered the top five countries in the export of ICT technological products along with South Korea, second position, Singapore and Germany in [inaudible]. China is like a black horse building its global ranking of digitalization through the export of technology itself. Is the same path of development available to others? To your country?

Finalizing the comparison of the level of digitalization of countries, it is worth mentioning in terms of price to quality of its Internet services, Ukraine is one of the leaders. [Cue this] to the anti-monopoly of our providers. We have thousands of them, and they are in a big

---

competition. So the [tariff] is pretty low, and the good quality connection is still here.

Governments sometimes try to capitalize on it, make less quantity of providers, but for these reasons Internet association exists. They are keeping the rights of these providers in safe. Next slide, please.

Conclusions of this presentation. It was quickly for you presented the analyzed data for regular users in Ukraine in five aspects of inequality. In digital Ukraine there is still a strong gap according to the regional and status aspects. Found methods to overcome them are currently being implemented.

The second conclusion, always question the statements and publications without official statistics provided in them. And third, an unexpected problem which we must think about is unwillingness of certain groups to change to digitalize. That was surprising for me, at least in this research. The second slide, please. Yeah, the next slide, please.

It shows some references, and the next slide will show my thanks to you for your attention and my email and Telegram nickname for whom it's easier to write there some questions and maybe just to talk if you want to talk about Internet and Ukraine and that sort of stuff, I will gladly listen to you and answer to you. Do you have questions? Maybe no.

---

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Thank you, Liza. I really like the subject matter of this presentation. Very nice. Yes, you have two questions. It looks like Yaovi had his hand raised first, so we'll go to Yaovi first. Yaovi, please proceed.

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Thank you, Deborah. And thank you, Liza, for the brilliant presentation. I just have a question on Slide 4 when you defined the regular user. It looks like maybe a word missing in the definition. If you can just quickly share the Slide 4 again, you mentioned once a month. Something like that. Slide 4, if you can display it again, the definition of a regular user. So there was something I was missing in Slide 4, like a word missing in the definition.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Siranush, can you go back to Slide 4?

YAOVI ATOHOUN: Yeah. But a very good presentation. Number 4, yeah. You say in this study is a person who will spend at least once a month. So that was not clear for me. Thank you very much.

LIZA KUKOVSKA: Yeah, thanks. Yeah, another question?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Okay, I guess I'm next in line. So, Liza, thank you very much for your great presentation. It is especially important for me as I live in a

---

neighboring country. I would like to ask you about the matter of organizations involved in the strengthening of the state of the Internet in Ukraine.

You mentioned, for example, that internal governmental and nongovernmental organizations are included in this process like during the presidential campaign there were free courses provided. But I would like to ask if there is any help or any grounds, any funding, any involvement from the external organizations for Ukraine such as, for example, Council of Europe or European Union. Do they provide some kind of help for the Internet penetration or the courses of computer literacy? Thank you.

LIZA KUKOVSKA: Yeah, you mean not Ukrainian government at least, yes?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: No, not internal involvement but external involvement.

LIZA KUKOVSKA: External, okay. From outside Ukraine, yes?

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: Yes.

---

LIZA KUKOVSKA:

Yes, okay, just two weeks before this ICANN conference started I read an article about Estonian, like, prime minister...Estonian...one of the Estonian ministers came to Ukraine and they had a talk here. And they actually provided some grants for little cities, like villages, to have Internet connection. So they helped our Ukrainian ministry of digitalization. They have also grants for providing Internet connection wireless to the little villages as well as now Estonia also helps just like two weeks before today happened.

Also, of course there is help from UN. Even in my presentation you can hear I referenced a couple of times UNDP. It's United Nations, like one of their branches. They have grants and I even participated last year in the grant by UNDP for helping digitalize Ukraine after Corona. They have grants for some startups, and we made a website for helping women in Ukrainian business who need to digitalize their businesses after the pandemic. So it was like some consultants and on the website you can fill out the form and some consultants will contact you and help with some work done.

So of course, UNDP, some countries like Estonia maybe. Yes, I think my answer is very long. I'm sorry.

UNIDENTIFIED MALE:

Yeah, okay, thank you for your very interesting notes.

LIZA KUKOVSKA:

Yeah, thanks.



---

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Okay, thank you. I don't see any other questions in the room, so we're going to move on. Thank you, Liza. Very well done. Okay, we're going to move on to our next presenter Cezara Panait. Cezara?

CEZARA PANAIT: Yes.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: We'll bring up your slides and then you can go ahead and proceed. You have the floor.

CEZARA PANAIT: Thank you. Hello everyone. My name is Cezara Panait. I'm very glad to be here. I'm part of ICANN NextGen 71. I'm head of digital policy at Europuls, center of European expertise, a thinktank on European affairs, and I'm coordinating the aspects of digital policy, including artificial intelligence, automation, and digital platforms. And I'm [inaudible] human rights [center], European University in Budapest and Vienna.

So I would like to talk to you today about improving gender balance in artificial intelligence and a bit about the regulatory framework on artificial intelligence.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Cezara, just remember to speak slowly. Thank you.

CEZARA PANAIT:

Okay. So on the agenda, we have a bit on the importance of promoting female leadership in artificial intelligence, the state of artificial intelligence regulatory framework, and also some examples of social inequality and discrimination driven or amplified by artificial intelligence. Then I'll talk briefly about some concepts about intersectionality and the matrix of domination that can bring some discriminatory aspects to women and gender minorities. And then in the end, I will talk a bit about how can we ensure gender balance in artificial intelligence policymaking. Next slide, please.

There are some facts already proven that gender gaps in artificial intelligence are real. For example, women currently make up 24% of the computer science workforce, and their salaries amount to only 66% of the salaries of their male counterparts, and another study found that only approximately 13% of AI paper authors are women and that, in relative terms, the proportion of the AI papers coauthored by at least one woman has not improved since the 1990s. So there are important differences in the proportion of males and females, especially in artificial intelligence technology, but also when it relates to leadership position, for example, [CEO] position or positions with decision making power. So my take here is that we should work on improving that so that we can have a regulatory framework that is relevant and is reflecting the vision of all parties interested. Next slide, please.

So we need more female representation in artificial intelligence. The World Economic Forum assessed gender gaps in artificial intelligence,

---

and they proved that only 22% of AI professionals globally are female, and the other 78% are male. And also, the artificial intelligence index in 2019 mentioned that across all educational institutions examined, males constituted a clear majority in the department, so 80% of AI professors on average were males. So it's a clear gap that needs to be solved in the future so that we can ensure that teachers, professors, AI professors, authors are well represented from the side of females. And also, another interesting report, Element AI, proved that 18% of authors, the leading 21 conferences in the field are women. Next slide, please.

With regards to the state of AI regulatory framework, we see that there are many bodies, international organizations that try to establish this to move forward some ideas. For example, we have at the EU level the AI Act, UNESCO for example is working on ethical principles on artificial intelligence and they are soon promoting their final position on that. OECD also mentioned the [G20 principles of] artificial intelligence. It's a landmark document in this field. At the same time, Council of Europe works on establishing rules, a legal framework for artificial intelligence with the CAHAI group that's based on rule of law, democracy and human rights as well as the principles, the guidelines of the organization. And for example, OEC, with their representative of media freedom, is also working on freedom of expression in artificial intelligence. Next slide, please.

DEBORAH ESCALERA:

Cezara, can you slow down a little bit more? Thank you.

---

CEZARA PANAIT: I was afraid I will go over ten minutes, so I tried to ...

DEBORAH ESCALERA: It's okay. We're fine on time. Thank you.

CEZARA PANAIT: Okay. Great. So there are some examples of social inequalities and discrimination which is reinforced by artificial intelligence. For example, we can see in the employment sector, algorithms assess the candidates. So most of the time, men were ranked higher than women, and their position was assessed just based on their sex. Also, there were some issues when there were pregnancy-related discriminations, for example, based on the data that they would have on the candidates. If they would understand based on the searches that one person made on the Internet on the search engines that that person wanted to get pregnant, they would not hire that person. And also, an interesting concept here is regarding intersectionality when multiple aspects altogether—for example, race, gender and sex—combine, these factors lead to discriminating one person. For example, black females or some aspect that altogether lead to discrimination by algorithm.

So in this regard, Internet regulators—mostly the persons who design the policies and those who get to establish some rules, generally, widely speaking, they are cisgender white males, and here we have some underrepresented women or gender minorities. So I think for this reason, we should be mindful of creating more opportunities for

---

women and for gender minorities to get involved in the decision making- process in a technological area, but especially artificial intelligence, which is now a topic of high interest and the regulators all over the world are trying to find the best solutions for regulating artificial intelligence, not only at EU level but we see that in US too, and at also different forums and international organizations worldwide. Next slide, please.

So, with regards to intersectionality and the matrix of domination, we can see that there's a complex cumulative manner in which the effects of different forms of discrimination combine, overlap or intersect, and it's a well-known case from General Motors when—exactly like I mentioned before, a black woman was discriminated, not because she was black, not because she was a woman, but because she was a black woman.

And at the same time, the matrix of domination is—so these issues of oppression that deal with race, class and gender that are interconnected. So, here we can talk about how to improve female leadership in artificial intelligence. Next slide, please.

Some solutions that are agreed with regards to improving these issues, these challenges of artificial intelligence include for example increasing the transparency of algorithms, because most of the algorithms are criticized for being opaque, like a black box, and because they are black box, they include biases, gender or racial biases. The importance of data here is crucial because here we can tackle historical biases and discrimination through better approaches on datasets. For example,

---

they might include conscious or unconscious biases. Conscious bias is when we realize that this aspect of the dataset will lead to discrimination, but at the same time, the unconscious bias might involve some stereotypes or preconceptions that someone would have without even realizing that they have a biased opinion on some persons, for example.

And here, some solutions include auditing algorithms, error corrections in the datasets, or data selections carefully that would involve representative and high-quality datasets. With regards to data ethics, I think ethical standards are very important nowadays, especially with regards to artificial intelligence and how we can promote and increase ethics in data. A very interesting new concept here is data feminism or AI feminism that is exactly trying to fix these discriminations against females. Next slide, please.

How to bridge the gap of gender imbalances in artificial intelligence? I would propose, first of all, improving awareness raising, because we need to be conscious and mindful of these issues for the beginning and then to try to solve that. We could start by working on research, on improving educational standards, but also on digital literacy skills, and developing such skills especially for females.

We know that in global south, there are less opportunities for women, and I think that a further step would be to improve such opportunities. And at the same time, we should work both on equality policies but also on equity policies at the points where equality, treating equally some parties would not be enough. Next slide, please.

---

This was my presentation, and I'm very happy to be here with you all. Thank you so much for your time and attention, and I'm looking forward to your questions if you have something to ask. Thank you so much, and I will put my e-mail in the chat if you have anything else to discuss further on. Thank you so much.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Thank you, Cezara. Very nicely done. Okay. Are there any questions for Cezara? I don't see any hands raised. Okay, so we're going to go on to our final presenter, Khouzeifi Issakha.

KHOUZEIFI ISSAKHA: Thank you, Deborah. First of all, I would like just to kindly ask you to allow me to open my camera in order to let the participants know who is speaking behind the camera, and kindly ask you also to close it because my Internet is very bad. It's also the reason why I have chosen this topic. Normally, I am living in France, but actually, I'm in a mission in Chad to organize a second edition of Youth IGF Africa.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Okay. We can see you right now.

KHOUZEIFI ISSAKHA: Okay. Thank you. So hi everyone, I am Khouzeifi Issakha Doud-bane, a PhD student in circular economic growth and sustainable development at [inaudible] school in France and general coordinator of Chad Youth IGF. Next slide, please.

---

I'm going to talk to you about digital inclusion and Internet accessibility ecosystem in Chad. The first part of my presentation is to give you an overview about the total numbers of Internet users and an overview about digital divides and most social medias used in Chad, and finally, proposing some recommendation to fostering digital inclusion and accessibility in Chad.

As you see in my presentation, in the introduction, there are some basic issues that have been raised in the first line, and we still have electricity issue in Chad and lack of access to Internet adding to this, the extremely expensive price of Internet access.

We also noticed that Internet users confuse Internet with social media and are totally victims of fake news, misinformation and disinformation, cybercrime, etc. Next slide, please.

Yes, so in this report, we have 2.86 million [of] 16 million of the population who are connected to Internet, which means 17% of the population. And 98.7% of them use only social media when they're connected to Internet, which means they don't use [inaudible] while connected to Internet. It is the big issue of confusing Internet with social media. Next slide, please.

So, over 16.67 million of the population, only 8 million have access to mobile connection, and 2.86 million of them have Internet access. And 470,000 of them use social media [inaudible]. Next slide, please.



---

Okay, over 470,000 of them, only 2.8% are active in social media, and 89 of them are like using the different social media. We are going to talk about Facebook, Instagram, LinkedIn and Twitter. Next slide, please.

Okay, Facebook is the first social media used in Chad with 430,000. 20.6% are them are female and 79.4 of them are male. Next slide, please.

Okay, Instagram and LinkedIn are the second and third most used social media networks in Chad with [1000 different] user of Internet. Instagram is like 77% used by male and 22% by female, while LinkedIn is 89.4 male and 10% are female. Next slide, please.

So when it comes to Twitter, only 10,000 are—11% male and 88% are female. And in Google research, we noted that people don't use Internet to [cultivate] but they just connect themselves to look at, for instance, first of all we have [inaudible] every time you search Chad in Google. Secondly, we have PMU, which is, back to the website, we have Real Madrid, we have Google, traduction, we have coronavirus in the 13th position, etc. Next slide, please.

When it comes to mobile connections, let's say that only 8 million of 16 are connected or have access to mobile, and 30% of them have access to Internet. So over the 8 million of the mobile connections, we have 90% of them using android device and 6% use Apple machines, computers and telephones. Next slide, please.

So, an ecommerce inclusion in national economic shows that we have only 21.8% of the population have bank account, and only 3% of them

---

use credit card to online purchase and bill online. Only 1.9% of them are female and 4.1% of them are male. So 1.2% of them use credit cards for online transactions and 3.8% of them use also for online transaction [inaudible]. Next slide, please.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Khouzeifi, are you there? Hello?

KHOUZEIFI ISSAKHA: Can you hear me, please?

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Yes, we can hear you now.

KHOUZEIFI ISSAKHA: Okay. Finally, my recommendation, I recommend providing schools and universities with digital resources, connectivity and systems. Final thing, youth-related startups is necessary to foster digital entrepreneurship, Internet-based business initiatives. Three, let's just give free access to Internet in public places creating a space whereby all stakeholders join their efforts and resources [inaudible].

DEBORAH ESCALERA: I think we lost you again, Khozeifi.

---

KHOUZEIFI ISSAKHA: It's making digital transformation to—I'm using my phone for my presentation and people are calling me outside. Sorry. So ICT skill building opportunities for the youth ensuring that the integration of ICT in education begins to take shape at earlier stage, starting from primary school, developing and putting in place a reliable and secure and affordable ICT and Internet infrastructure. Thank you for your kind attention.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Thank you, Khouzeifi. Are there any questions for Khouzeifi? Okay, thank you so much for your presentation. Very well done. Okay, our final presenter is Aysel Maharramli. Aysel, thank you for joining us.

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: Yes. Hello to everyone.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: I just want to remind you to speak slowly, and you have ten minutes. Thank you so much.

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: Okay. My topic is about phishing. What's phishing? Next slide, please. The phishing is [fraudulent] practice where cybercriminals send e-mails—I will say them types—phishing is a [fraudulent] practice where cybercriminals send e-mails pretending to be from a reputable organization or someone who is known to the recipient.

---

Popular [forms] that these criminals will use include pretending to be banks, [buildings, societies,] retailers, government organizations and [inaudible]. Phishing is a form of social engineering where criminals use [psychology to leverage] attacks. In my presentation now, I will say about types of phishing, examples of phishing, techniques of phishing and prevention methods, how we can prevent from phishing attacks. Next slide, please.

They have some types of phishing, and I will explain the types of this phishing. It's social engineering, link manipulation, spear phishing, clone phishing, and voice phishing. Next slide, please.

About social engineering phishing, this phishing is an attempt to fraudulently acquire sensitive information such as usernames, passwords and credit card details by masquerading as a trustworthy entity in an electronic communication. Phishing is typically carried out by email spoofing or instant messaging, and it often directs users to enter details at a fake website whose look and feel are almost identical to the legitimate one. Next slide, please.

When it comes to link manipulation, as shown in my slide, by manipulating the links, for example, instead of writing Facebook with oo, the [inaudible] I can say write that like 00, and it looks like Facebook, and these misspelled URLs or subdomains are common tricks used by attacker. This appears similar as the genuine [inaudible] side, sender address of the e-mail also appears as originated from the [inaudible] company. Next slide, please.

---

When it comes to spear phishing, a spear phishing attack is an attempt to acquire sensitive information or access to a computer system by sending—

UNIDENTIFIED MALE: [inaudible]

DEBORAH ESCALERA: We're having some feedback there. Is that you?

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: No, it's not mine.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Okay. I'm sorry. Maybe ...

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: Someone else maybe opened their microphone.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Yes. That's fine. Please proceed.

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: Okay. A computer system by sending counterfeit messages that appear to be legitimate. The goal of spear phishing is to acquire sensitive information such as usernames, passwords, and other personal information. Next slide, please.

---

Clone phishing is a type of phishing attack in which a legitimate, and previously delivered, email containing a link or attachment has had its content and recipient address(es) stolen by a malicious hacker and used to create an almost identical, or cloned, email.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Aysel, can you slow down just a little bit, please, for the interpreters?

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: Of course. I think that I have very little time, Deborah.

DEBORAH ESCALERA: Don't worry. We're okay on time. Just slow down a little bit. Thank you.

AYSEL MAHARRAMLI: Okay. Vishing is a cybercrime that uses the phone to steal personal confidential information from victims. Often referred to as voice phishing, cybercriminals use savvy social engineering tactics to convince victims to act, giving up private information and access to bank accounts.

How we can spot phishing e-mail? We can check the sender's e-mail addresses, match the website addresses, and also, no matter who you see, it could always be suspicious of an e-mail that asks for your personal information or login details. And we don't need to download attachments from suspicious e-mails. Beware also of e-mails with generic introduction, like dear valued customers, etc. [inaudible] sites.

---

And we need to check for spelling and grammar errors in the suspicious e-mail. And also, don't reply, we don't need to reply directly to a suspicious e-mail. We need to remember that a phisher is a virtual door-to-door con artist and can sometimes be very convincing.

Okay, how we can save from the phishing? We need to keep our computers secure and use anti-spam software, use anti-spyware software, use Microsoft baseline security analyzer, and of course, use firewall. And I want to say about how phishing can damage our business. Once someone clicks on a link or downloads a file, the terminal can steal sensitive information such as our usernames, password or our bank account information and financial data. Theft of data is a key danger with successful phishing attacks, and 60% of small businesses that suffer an attack close down within six months. Phishing can cost both victim and organization money, [inaudible] successful targeted hackers can use this asset to carry out any number of malicious activities.

That's all, I think. Thanks for everybody's attention.

DEBORAH ESCALERA:

Thank you, Aysel. Are there any questions for Aysel? I don't see any hands in the room. Okay, that was our last presenter. With that, I'd like to thank everybody who attended today, and a special thanks to my colleague, Siranush Vardanyan who ran all the slides for me today. Without her, I could not have done this. A special thanks to my mentors who have been an incredible support to me, and I can't tell you how proud of my NextGen I am. You guys did an incredible job today. You are

---

so incredibly talented, and you did a great job. I'm so impressed with all of your presentations today. Great job. Give yourself a hand. Fantastic.

Thank you for everybody who attended today and shared this experience with us. A big shoutout and a big thank you to our talented interpreters, and of course, our tech team who support us at every meeting and who we can't live without. Thank you so much. And I wish you all a fantastic ICANN 71. Attend as many sessions as you can, and please attend those FIKA, coffee breaks, and have fun. Thank you, everybody, for attending today, and thank you for your support. Please reach out if you have questions at [engagement@icann.org](mailto:engagement@icann.org). Again, thank you so much.

**[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]**